

010-02-2011 Western Grebe Schuylkill Co., 30 November 2011
First Round Votes 4/3

Class III

Comments: Description was right on. I have to accept this sighting
Al Guarente

Class III

Comments: I believe the description is good enough to accept this identification.
Dave DeReamus

Class III

Comments: This seems like a very good description of Western Grebe despite its rarity in Pennsylvania. This is an accept vote based on the documentation – I'm not familiar with the observer – if anyone has reservations, I'd be happy to discuss the record.
Tom Johnson

Class III

Comments: I am willing to accept this as *Aechmophorus* sp., as the description touches on all of the key points for this group, including an indication of the bird's size. However there is not enough detail/discussion to eliminate Clark's Grebe. The key point on the coloration around the eye is stated simply as "the black on top of the head went down just past the eye". For an *Aechmophorus* in non-breeding plumage I believe a more critical examination of the lores is key, and this is absent from the discussion.
Geoff Malosh

Vote: Class 4-A

Discussion: This is an interesting sighting. I feel the observer likely had a Western Grebe, but I am not sure she completely ruled out a Clark's Grebe.
Ramsay Koury

Class IV-A

Comments: Based on the description, I cannot conclusively rule out Clark's Grebe. The description (which could have been lifted from a field guide) is suggestive of *Aechmophorus* sp. I am troubled by the observer's admission that she was looking through the book instead of watching the bird.
Ben Coulter

Class IV-A

Comments: This may be a good record but I feel that there should be mention of Double-crested Cormorant, with a juvenile cormorant possibly being the bird most people would mistake for an *Aechmophorus* grebe.
Drew Weber